5D Weyl Double Copy

Pujian Mao

Center for Joint Quantum Studies, Tianjin University

17 Nov. 2024, @ICTS

Work in collaboration with Weicheng Zhao and Jun-Bao Wu

2409.06786, 2411.04774

4 E K 4 E K

◂**◻▸ ◂ਗ਼▸**

 QQ

- 2 [Classical double copy](#page-5-0)
- 3 [Weyl double copy in 4d](#page-8-0)
- 4 [Weyl double copy in 5d](#page-13-0)

 \sim

4 ロ ▶ 4 何

造

Full four-gluon tree amplitude in Yang-Mills theory

Figure 3: The three Feynman diagrams corresponding to the s , t and u channels.

$$
i\mathcal{A}_4^{\text{tree}} = g^2 \left(\frac{c_s n_s}{s} + \frac{c_t n_t}{t} + \frac{c_u n_u}{u} \right) \tag{1}
$$

4 0 F

where

$$
s=(p_1+p_2)^2, \quad t=(p_2+p_3)^2, \quad u=(p_3+p_1)^2,\tag{2}
$$

are kinematic invariants of a four-point scattering process.

O The s-channel color factor

$$
c_s = -2f^{a_1a_2b}f^{b a_3 a_4} \tag{3}
$$

The s-channel kinematic numerator

$$
n_{s} = -\frac{1}{2} \left[(\epsilon_{1} \cdot \epsilon_{2}) p_{1}^{\mu} + 2(\epsilon_{1} \cdot p_{2}) \epsilon_{2}^{\mu} - (1 \leftrightarrow 2) \right] \cdot \left[(\epsilon_{3} \cdot \epsilon_{4}) p_{3\mu} + 2(\epsilon_{3} \cdot p_{4}) \epsilon_{4\mu} - (3 \leftrightarrow 4) \right] - \frac{1}{2} s \left[(\epsilon_{1} \cdot \epsilon_{3}) (\epsilon_{2} \cdot \epsilon_{4}) - (\epsilon_{1} \cdot \epsilon_{4}) (\epsilon_{2} \cdot \epsilon_{3}) \right]
$$
\n(4)

• The color/kinematic duality

$$
c_s + c_t + c_u = 0, \quad n_s + n_t + n_u = 0 \tag{5}
$$

The kinematic factors satisfy the same relations as the color factors suggesting that they are mutually exchangeable.

[Bern, Carrasco, Johansson, 2008; 2010]

つひひ

Swapping color factors for kinematic factors in the YM four-point amplitude, which gives a new gauge-invariant object that, is a four-graviton amplitude,

$$
i\mathcal{A}_4^{\text{tree}}|_{g \to \frac{\kappa}{2}, c_i \to n_i} = i\mathcal{M}_4^{\text{tree}} = (\frac{\kappa}{2})^2 \left(\frac{n_s^2}{s} + \frac{n_t^2}{t} + \frac{n_u^2}{u} \right) \tag{6}
$$

- The new amplitude has the following properties:
	- the external states are captured by symmetric polarization tensors
	- the interactions are of the two-derivative type
	- invariant under linearized diffeomorphism transformations
- This amplitude should describe the scattering of four gravitons of Einstein theory.

Double copy of classical solutions in the Kerr-Schild form

• The Kerr-Schild form is made by a null vector field k_{μ} and a scalar function ϕ in the form

$$
g_{\mu\nu} = \eta_{\mu\nu} + \phi k_{\mu} k_{\nu} \ . \tag{7}
$$

- One can show that k^{μ} is null when contracted with both the full metric $g_{\mu\nu}$ and the Minkowski one $\eta_{\mu\nu}$.
- The inverse metric is just

$$
g^{\mu\nu} = \eta^{\mu\nu} - \phi k^{\mu} k^{\nu} \tag{8}
$$

We can raise the index of k using both $g^{\mu\nu}$ and $\eta^{\mu\nu}$.

Stationary phase space

In the stationary case in which all time derivatives vanish and $\smash{k^0=1}$ where all dynamics in the zeroth component contained in the scalar field, the Ricci tensor is reduced to

$$
R^0{}_0 = \frac{1}{2} \nabla^2 \phi \tag{9}
$$

$$
R^{i}{}_{0} = -\frac{1}{2}\partial_{j}\left[\partial^{i}(\phi k^{j}) - \partial^{j}(\phi k^{i})\right]
$$
 (10)

$$
R^{i}_{\;j} = \frac{1}{2} \partial_{l} \left[\partial^{i} (\phi k^{l} k_{j}) + \partial_{j} (\phi k^{l} k^{j}) - \partial^{l} (\phi k^{i} k_{l}) \right] \tag{11}
$$

- Define a vector field $A_{\mu} = \phi k_{\mu}$, with the standard definition of field strength.
- The vacuum Einstein equation implies that the gauge field satisfies Maxwell equations

$$
\partial_{\mu}F^{\mu\nu} = \partial_{\mu}\left[\partial^{\mu}(\phi k^{\nu}) - \partial^{\nu}(\phi k^{\mu})\right] = 0. \tag{12}
$$

[Monteiro, O'Connell, White, 2014]

 \bullet Using a pair of lightcone coordinates (u, v, x, y) , we can express a pp-wave using

$$
k_{\mu}dx^{\mu} = du = dz - dt, \quad \phi = \phi(u, x, y)
$$
 (13)

• Einstein equation yields

$$
\partial_{\mu}\partial^{\mu}\phi = 0. \tag{14}
$$

• The gauge field $A_{\mu} = \phi k_{\mu}$ a solution of the Maxwell equations.

Weyl double copy for type D solutions

• The Weyl double copy (WDC) formula

$$
C_{ABCD} = \frac{1}{S} f_{(AB} f_{cD)}.
$$
\n(15)

 \bullet C_{ABCD} is the anti-delf-dual part of the Weyl tensor,

$$
C_{ABCD} = \frac{1}{4} \sigma^{\mu\nu}_{AB} \sigma^{\alpha\beta}_{CD} W_{\mu\nu\alpha\beta}.
$$
 (16)

 \bullet f_{AB} is defined from the field strength of the Maxwell tensor

$$
f_{AB} = \frac{1}{2} \sigma_{AB}^{\mu\nu} F_{\mu\nu}.
$$
 (17)

[Luna, Monteiro, NIcholson, O'Connell, 2018]

Van der Waerden matrices

$$
\sigma_{AB}^{\mu\nu} = \sigma_{A\dot{A}}^{[\mu} \tilde{\sigma}^{\nu] \dot{A} C} \epsilon_{CB}, \qquad \sigma_{A\dot{A}}^{\mu} = e_{a}^{\mu} \sigma_{A\dot{A}}^{a}, \qquad \sigma_{A\dot{A}}^{a} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (1, \sigma^{i}).
$$
\nPujian Mao (TJU)

\n17 Nov. 2024, QICTS

\n9/28

Plebanski-Demianski metric

• The line-element in (p, q, τ, σ) coordinates

$$
ds^{2} = \frac{1}{(1 - pq)^{2}} \left[\frac{p^{2} + q^{2}}{P(p)} dp^{2} + \frac{p^{2} + q^{2}}{Q(q)} dq^{2} + \frac{P(p)}{p^{2} + q^{2}} (d\tau + q^{2} d\sigma)^{2} - \frac{Q(q)}{p^{2} + q^{2}} (d\tau - p^{2} d\sigma)^{2} \right], \quad (19)
$$

where

$$
P(p) = \gamma (1 - p4) + 2np - \epsilon p2 + 2mp3, \t(20)
$$

$$
Q(q) = \gamma (1 - q4) - 2mq + \epsilon q2 - 2nq3.
$$
 (21)

イロト イ币

造

 QQ

The Weyl double copy

• The Weyl spinor

$$
C_{ABCD}\xi^{A}\xi^{B}\xi^{C}\xi^{D} = -\frac{3i}{2}\frac{(m+in)(1-pq)^{3}[(\xi^{1})^{2}-(\xi^{2})^{2}]^{2}}{(p-iq)^{3}},
$$
 (22)

where $\xi^A=(\xi^1,\xi^2)$ is an arbitrary spinor.

• The field strength spinor

$$
f_{AB}\xi^{A}\xi^{B} = -\frac{1}{2}\frac{(m+in)(1-pq)^{3}[(\xi^{1})^{2} - (\xi^{2})^{2}]}{(p-iq)^{2}}
$$
(23)

• The scalar field

$$
S = \frac{i}{6} \frac{(m + in)(1 - pq)^3}{(p - iq)}
$$
 (24)

satisfies the wave equation in the flat background.

Weyl double copy for type N solutions

• In the Newman-Penrose formalism, the type N WDC reads

$$
\Psi_4 = \frac{1}{5} (\Phi_2)^2.
$$
 (25)

• The Bianchi identities

$$
D\Psi_4 = (\rho - 4\epsilon)\Psi_4, \qquad \delta\Psi_4 = (\tau - 4\beta)\Psi_4. \tag{26}
$$

The Maxwell's equation for degenerate Maxwell fields

$$
D\Phi_2 = (\rho - 2\epsilon)\Phi_2, \qquad \delta\Phi_2 = (\tau - 2\beta)\Phi_2. \tag{27}
$$

• The scalar field

$$
D \log S - \rho = 0, \qquad \delta \log S - \tau = 0, \tag{28}
$$

which are integrable $(\delta D - D\delta)S = \delta \rho - D\tau$.

• Wave equation on type N background

$$
\Box S = 0. \tag{29}
$$

[Godazgar² , Monteiro, Veiga, Pope, 2020; [202](#page-10-0)[1\]](#page-12-0)

Decomposition of the Weyl spinor and the Maxwell spinor

$$
C_{ABCD} = a_{(A}b_Bc_Cd_D), \qquad f_{AB} = a_{(A}b_{B)}.
$$
 (30)

The Weyl double copy in the Newman-Penrose formalism

$$
\Psi_4 = 3c \frac{(\Phi_2)^2}{S}, \qquad \Psi_3 = 3c \frac{\Phi_2 \Phi_1}{S},
$$

$$
\Psi_2 = c \frac{2(\Phi_1)^2 + \Phi_0 \Phi_2}{S}, \qquad (31)
$$

$$
\Psi_1 = 3c \frac{\Phi_0 \Phi_1}{S}, \qquad \Psi_0 = 3c \frac{(\Phi_0)^2}{S}.
$$

[Godazgar², Monteiro, Veiga, Pope, 2021; Mao, Zhao, 2023]

5d vielbein formalism

The vielbein bases

$$
l = e_0 = e^1
$$
, $n = e_1 = e^0$, $m_i = e_i = m^i = e^i$, $i = 2, 3, 4$, (32)

where l and n are null, and m_i are spacelike. The basis vectors satisfy the orthogonal and normalization conditions

$$
l \cdot l = n \cdot n = l \cdot m^i = n \cdot m^i = 0,
$$
 (33)

$$
l \cdot n = 1, \quad m^i \cdot m^j = \delta^{ij}.
$$
 (34)

Directional derivatives

$$
D = I^{\mu} \partial_{\mu}, \qquad \Delta = n^{\mu} \partial_{\mu}, \qquad \delta_i = m_i^{\mu} \partial_{\mu}. \tag{35}
$$

The following quantities are defined to denote the spin coefficients

$$
L_{\mu\nu} = \nabla_{\nu} I_{\mu}, \quad N_{\mu\nu} = \nabla_{\nu} n_{\mu}, \quad M_{\mu\nu}^{k} = \nabla_{\nu} m_{\mu}^{k}.
$$
 (36)

5d type N spacetime in CMPP classification

• Decomposition of the Weyl tensor

$$
C_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} = 4C_{0i0j}n_{\{\mu}m_{\nu}^{i}n_{\rho}m_{\sigma\}}^{j} + 8C_{010i}n_{\{\mu}l_{\nu}n_{\rho}m_{\sigma\}}^{i} + 4C_{0ijk}n_{\{\mu}m_{\nu}^{i}m_{\rho}^{j}m_{\sigma\}}^{k}
$$

+ 4C_{0101}n_{\{\mu}l_{\nu}n_{\rho}l_{\sigma\}} + 4C_{01ij}n_{\{\mu}l_{\nu}m_{\rho}^{i}m_{\sigma\}}^{j} + 8C_{0i1j}n_{\{\mu}m_{\nu}^{i}l_{\rho}m_{\sigma\}}^{j} + C_{ijkl}m_{\{\mu}l_{\mu}l_{\sigma\}}^{i} + 8C_{101i}n_{\{\mu}n_{\nu}l_{\rho}m_{\sigma\}}^{i} + 8C_{101i}n_{\{\mu}n_{\nu}l_{\rho}m_{\sigma\}}^{i}
+ 8C_{101i}n_{\{\mu}n_{\nu}l_{\rho}m_{\sigma\}}^{i} + 4C_{1ijk}n_{\{\mu}m_{\nu}^{i}m_{\rho}^{j}m_{\sigma\}}^{k} + 4C_{1i1j}n_{\{\mu}m_{\nu}^{i}l_{\rho}m_{\sigma\}}^{i}.

For a type N solution, the non-zero Weyl scalars are $\psi_{ij} = \textit{C}_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma}$ n $^{\mu}$ m $^{i\nu}$ n $^{\rho}$ m $^{j\sigma}$ in the null frame

Correspondingly, $\phi_i = F_{\mu\nu} n^\mu m^{i\nu}$ are the non-zero Maxwell scalars of a degenerate Maxwell field [Coley, Milson, Pravda, Pravdova, 2004]

• Five γ matrices are chosen as the bases to connect the spacetime indices and spinor indices

$$
\gamma_{AB}^{\hat{\mu}} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & \sigma^{\hat{\mu}\alpha}{}_{\beta'} \\ \tilde{\sigma}^{\hat{\mu}}{}_{\alpha'}{}^{\beta} & 0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \gamma_{AB}^{4} = -i \begin{pmatrix} \epsilon^{\alpha\beta} & 0 \\ 0 & \epsilon_{\alpha'\beta'} \end{pmatrix}.
$$
 (37)

 $\hat{\mu} = 0, 1, 2, 3$ denotes the first four components of a 5d vector

- $A, B = 1, 2$ are spinor indices for 5d quantities
- $\bullet \ \alpha, \beta$ are now the spinor indices in the Van der Waerden matrices
- Any component of γ_{AB}^μ , for any given number of A , B , and $\mu = 0, 1, 2, 3, 4$, defines a (2×2) matrix

[Monteiro, Nicholson, O'Connell, 2018]

Correspondingly, the spinor bases in 5d are chosen as

$$
k_1^A = \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ \bar{\sigma}^{\alpha'} \end{pmatrix}, \quad k_2^A = \begin{pmatrix} o_\alpha \\ 0 \end{pmatrix},
$$

\n
$$
n_1^A = \begin{pmatrix} \iota_\alpha \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad n_2^A = -\begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ \bar{\iota}^{\alpha'} \end{pmatrix}.
$$
 (38)

One can simply package them as $k_a^A = (k_1^A, k_2^A)$ and $n_a^A = (n_1^A, n_2^A)$, where indices a and b are packaged from two basis spinors.

5d WDC relation for type N spacetime

The algebraic classification in the spinorial formalism is equivalent to the CMPP classification.

[Monteiro, Nicholson, O'Connell, 2018]

For the 5d type N spacetime, the non-zero little group bi-spinors for the Weyl tensor are

$$
\psi_{abcd}^{(4)} = C_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} \sigma^{\mu\nu}_{AB} \sigma^{\rho\sigma}_{CD} n^A_{~a} n^B_{~b} n^C_{~c} n^D_{~d},\tag{39}
$$

where $\sigma^{\mu\nu}_{\quad AB} = \frac{1}{2}$ $\frac{1}{2}(\gamma^{\mu}_{AC}\gamma^{\nu}{}_{B}^{C}-\gamma^{\nu}_{AC}\gamma^{\mu}{}_{E}^{C}$ \mathcal{L}_{B}).

A natural generalization of the WDC formula to 5d for the type N spacetime can be written as

$$
\psi_{abcd}^{(4)} \propto \phi_{(ab}^{(2)} \phi_{cd}^{(2)}, \tag{40}
$$

where $\phi^{(2)}_{ab}=F_{\mu\nu}\sigma^{\mu\nu}_{\quad AB}n^A_{~B}n^B_{~b}$ are the non-zero little group bi-spinors of a degenerate Maxwell tensor. Ω • More explicitly, we propose

$$
\psi_{1111}^{(4)} = \frac{3c}{5_1} \phi_{11}^{(2)} \phi_{11}^{(2)}, \qquad \psi_{2222}^{(4)} = \frac{3c}{5'_1} \phi_{22}^{(2)} \phi_{22}^{(2)},
$$

\n
$$
\psi_{1112}^{(4)} = \frac{3c}{5_2} \phi_{11}^{(2)} \phi_{12}^{(2)}, \qquad \psi_{2221}^{(4)} = \frac{3c}{5'_2} \phi_{22}^{(2)} \phi_{21}^{(2)},
$$

\n
$$
\psi_{1212}^{(4)} = \frac{c}{5_3} [\phi_{11}^{(2)} \phi_{22}^{(2)} + 2(\phi_{12}^{(2)})^2].
$$
\n(41)

4 **D F**

We have introduced two independent complex scalar fields S_1 , S_2 and one real scalar field S_3 .

5D Weyl double copy relation in vielbein formalism

Converting the WDC formulas [\(41\)](#page-18-0) to the vielbein formalism

$$
\psi_{22} - \psi_{33} - 2i\psi_{23} = \frac{3c}{S_1} [(\phi_2)^2 - (\phi_3)^2 - 2i\phi_2\phi_3],
$$

\n
$$
\psi_{22} - \psi_{33} + 2i\psi_{23} = \frac{3c}{S_1'} [(\phi_2)^2 - (\phi_3)^2 + 2i\phi_2\phi_3],
$$

\n
$$
\psi_{34} + i\psi_{24} = \frac{3c}{S_2} (\phi_3\phi_4 + i\phi_2\phi_4),
$$

\n
$$
\psi_{34} - i\psi_{24} = \frac{3c}{S_2'} (\phi_3\phi_4 - i\phi_2\phi_4),
$$

\n
$$
\psi_{44} = \frac{c}{S_3} [(\phi_2)^2 + (\phi_3)^2 + 4(\phi_4)^2].
$$
\n(42)

The above equations present a natural extension of the WDC formulas to 5d for the type N spacetime.

Reductions of the type N spacetime

- We now consider a 4d-like reduction of the 5d type N spacetime where we impose the restrictions $\psi_{4i} = 0$ for the Weyl scalars.
- The traceless property of the Weyl tensor then yields $\psi_{22} = -\psi_{33}$. Correspondingly, the Maxwell scalars and zeroth copies should be $\phi_4 = 0$, $S_3 \rightarrow \infty$, where the divergent scalar field S_3 is chosen to turn off the extra component from the doubling in five dimensions.
- We introduce the following definitions

$$
\Psi_4 = -(\psi_{22} + i\psi_{23}), \quad \bar{\Psi}_4 = -(\psi_{22} - i\psi_{23}), \n\varphi_2 = -\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\phi_2 + i\phi_3), \quad \bar{\varphi}_2 = -\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\phi_2 - i\phi_3), \n\delta = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\delta_2 - i\delta_3), \quad \bar{\delta} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\delta_2 + i\delta_3), \n\hat{\delta} = i\delta_4, \quad S = \frac{S_1}{c}.
$$
\n(43)

Bianchi identity and Maxwell's equation

$$
D\Psi_4 = -(L_{22} + iL_{23})\Psi_4,
$$

\n
$$
\delta\Psi_4 = -\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \left[(2L_{12} + 2M_{33}^2 - L_{21}) + i(L_{31} - 2L_{13} + 2M_{32}^2) \right] \Psi_4,
$$

\n
$$
\hat{\delta}\Psi_4 = \left[(M_{42}^3 - 2M_{24}^3) + i(L_{41} - 2L_{14} + M_{42}^2) \right] \Psi_4,
$$
\n(44)

and

$$
D\varphi_2 = -(L_{22} + iL_{23})\varphi_2,
$$

\n
$$
\delta\varphi_2 = -\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \left[(L_{12} + M_{33}^2 - L_{21}) + i(L_{31} - L_{13} + M_{32}^2) \right] \varphi_2,
$$

\n
$$
\hat{\delta}\varphi_2 = \left[(M_{42}^3 - M_{24}^3) + i(L_{41} - L_{14} + M_{42}^2) \right] \varphi_2.
$$
\n(45)

イロト

重

• The WDC formula in the reduced case is simply given by

$$
\Psi_4 = \frac{1}{5} (\varphi_2)^2.
$$
 (46)

- Now it is clear that the previously chosen divergent scalar field S_3 is to prevent the mixing term constructed from $\varphi_2\bar{\varphi}_2$ in the Weyl doubling.
- Such a term is not involved at all in the 4d WDC relation, and it is reasonable to have a special treatment in 5d by simply imposing that there is no Weyl scalar associated to the $\varphi_2 \bar{\varphi}_2$ term.

Integrability conditions and wave equation

Substituting the WDC relation [\(46\)](#page-22-0) into the Bianchi identity and simplifying them with the Maxwell's equation on the type N background, we obtain the equations for the scalar field.

$$
D \log S = -(L_{22} + iL_{23}),
$$

\n
$$
\delta \log S = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (L_{21} - iL_{31}),
$$

\n
$$
\hat{\delta} \log S = M_{42}^3 + i(M_{42}^2 + L_{41}).
$$
\n(47)

- • Following the treatment in 4d, we have proven the integrability conditions for the above differential equations.
- \bullet It is straightforward to verify that any solution of [\(47\)](#page-23-0) solves the Klein-Gordon equation $\square S = 0$ on the type N background.

New realization of 4d type D WDC

- We extend the type N analysis in 4d to the type D case.
- Any type D vacuum solution admits an algebraically general Maxwell scalar on the curved background that squares to give the Weyl scalar.
- **•** Bianchi identities

$$
D\Psi_2 = 3\rho\Psi_2, \quad \Delta\Psi_2 = -3\mu\Psi_2, \quad \delta\Psi_2 = 3\tau\Psi_2, \quad \bar{\delta}\Psi_2 = -3\pi\Psi_2.
$$
\n(48)

• Maxwell's equations

$$
D\Phi_1 = 2\rho\Phi_1, \quad \Delta\Phi_1 = -2\mu\Phi_1, \quad \delta\Phi_1 = 2\tau\Phi_1, \quad \bar{\delta}\Phi_1 = -2\pi\Phi_1.
$$
\n(49)

• The type D WDC relation

$$
\Psi_2 = \frac{1}{5} \Phi_1^2. \tag{50}
$$

New realization of 4d type D WDC

 \bullet Equations for the scalar field S

 $D \log S = \rho$, $\Delta \log S = -\mu$, $\delta \log S = \tau$, $\overline{\delta} \log S = -\pi$. (51)

• Integrability conditions

$$
(\delta D - D\delta) \log S = \delta \rho - D\tau, \quad (\bar{\delta} \Delta - \Delta \bar{\delta}) \log S = \Delta \pi - \bar{\delta} \mu,
$$

\n
$$
(\Delta D - D\Delta) \log S = \Delta \rho + D\mu, \quad (\bar{\delta} \delta - \delta \bar{\delta}) \log S = \bar{\delta} \tau + \delta \pi,
$$

\n
$$
(\bar{\delta} D - D\bar{\delta}) \log S = \bar{\delta} \rho + D\pi, \quad (\delta \Delta - \Delta \delta) \log S = -\delta \mu - \Delta \tau.
$$
 (52)

• The WDC relation defines a scalar field

$$
(\Box + 2\Psi_2)S = 0. \tag{53}
$$

- We extend the type D WDC to 5d for a special class of vacuum solutions satisfying $C_{\hat{\beta} \hat{h} \hat{c}^A} = 0$, where the integrability conditions consist of 10 equations.
- The scalar equaiton

$$
\left[\Box - 2\psi_2 + 2(L_{41})^2\right] S = 0. \tag{54}
$$

Specially chosen fifth basis m^4 from $\mathcal{C}_{\hat{\mathsf{a}}\hat{\mathsf{b}}\hat{c}\mathsf{4}}=0$ with the deviation tensor

$$
\nabla_{\mu}m_{\nu}^{4}=L_{41}(m_{\mu}^{2}m_{\nu}^{2}+m_{\mu}^{3}m_{\nu}^{3}+l_{\mu}n_{\nu}+n_{\mu}l_{\nu}).
$$
 (55)

 \bullet The expansion L_{41} is the only non-zero component in the deviation that affects the evolution of the scalar S along the fifth direction m^4 .

Thanks for your attention!

4 **D F**

造